Terms of Reference

Development of a Transit Oriented Development Implementation Program for the City of Addis Ababa

I. Background

A. AN OVERVIEW OF THE CITY

1. Addis Ababa was established in 1887 by emperor Menelik II and Empress Taytu. The city is located in the middle of the country, on a 2400-meter high plateau at the foot of Mount Entoto, with nearly a quarter of the city areas located on relatively steep slope areas. Its total area extends about 540 square kilometers, and is divided into 10 sub-cities and 116 woredas for administrative purpose. Since its establishment, Addis Ababa has undergone many changes in terms of its size and demographics, its finance and economic structure, its physical and spatial organization. In the period of EPRDF (1991-present) where a robust private sector has been allowed to emerge, the city’s population has grown by more than 80 percent, the total built up area has increased by at least 25 percent, the city’s economy has been growing by double digits, and more infrastructure and housing development had been implemented. These large infrastructure investments in road construction had accelerated the process of change. Condominium housing in more than a hundred sites in the city, large residential housing construction by private real estate companies, and the booming of the construction of commercial high-rise buildings all have been influential in reshaping the spatial organization and productivity of economic activities.

2. Addis Ababa is the highest metropolis in Africa. It is a fast growing city, like other major African metropolises. Its population is more than 3.5 million, more than ten times larger than the second largest city in the country. Over the next 15 years, the population is expected to grow annually by more than 3.8% and within 50 years of time, the urban region (Addis Ababa and its surroundings) will surpass ten million people.

3. The city has experienced spatial spread mostly towards the Southern, Eastern and Southwestern directions from the city main center. The spread is mainly guided by topography and the road network development. This signifies the importance of the coordinated urban land use and transportation planning initiatives to achieve the goals of a ‘transit oriented development’ of the city. However, in the past few years the city has expanded horizontally in an unsystematic way, making service delivery very difficult. Services such as transportation, water and sewer lines are increasingly overburdened due to this unstructured settlement pattern. The new structure plan of Addis Ababa city anticipates these challenges clearly. Appropriate and timely service delivery is the core concept in the new structure plan development. Hence, the preparation of the new city plan will provide the platform for all to raise concerns, maximize opportunities and revise strategies. The ultimate goal of the new plan is to ensure that the city contributes its share in bringing the national economy to the level of middle income countries; and in the process, improve the living standard of its residents. This role shall also include making the capital competitive at this age of globalization and bringing about overall socioeconomic transformation.
B. Addis Ababa Master Plan Process

4. The Addis Ababa City Development Plan, approved in 2015, comprises a structure plan, an action oriented strategic development framework and a management reform component. The structure plan had provided an overall framework for the spatial development of the city. The action oriented strategic development plans had prioritized various key urban issues to be implemented in five years (i.e. housing, urban road network and transport, manufacturing industries and large storage facilities, environment, and inner city renewal and upgrading); and proposed implementation mechanisms and financial investment requirements. The rationale for using this structural plan within a combination of the performance oriented plans had been to give the plan adequate legal basis through the Structure Plan, regulations, and norms and standards; to ensure flexibility and participation; and to give more emphasis to strategic issues due to the limited resources in the city. Administrative restructuring, defining the different roles of government (e.g. state vs. municipal functions), service decentralization and improvement, and capacity building are the central themes of the management reform aspect of the plan for its future implementation. Because, the implementation of previous City Development Plan had stressed the importance of developing standard infrastructure facilities and services on a par with the city’s international role, the road sector quality and volume of infrastructure services is far too inadequate, and the city’s main center and sub-centers remained unimplemented. That said, major concepts and ideas which had been forwarded by the City Development Plan (e.g. condominium housing) had sparked innovative projects and programs that are being implemented at the city level, but lacks integration of land use and transportation.

5. The new plan preparation has learned lessons from the challenges encountered with implementation of the previous plan. Those challenges were faced either for lack of foresight by the Plan, or due to some constraints associated with its implementation. Regarding major shortcomings of the previous Plan itself, it had failed to sufficiently elaborate implementation mechanisms (including institutional set-up and financial sources) to encourage and guide proposed strategic investments. For example, some of the interventions proposed in the Local Development Plans (LDPs) lacked critical understanding and interpretation of land use and transportation integration. Hence, the new City Development Plan gave these issues due consideration and proposed transit oriented development (TOD) areas. But effectively implementing these TOD areas in a timely manner will require detailed, simple and practical “roadmaps” to facilitate their development.

6. The urban structure of the city envisioned under the new master plan is a polycentric organization connected with high density corridors development. Basic services and major facilities are organized at the central area for better accessibility and mobility. In the new structural plan, central areas (including the old core of the city) and some active business corridors are selected as strategic investment areas for urban renewal. Thus TOD will fall under these broad objectives and the urban designs will largely focus in these high density areas but also cover some segments of business corridors attached to the housing project site at the expansion sub cities. This
focus were to bring in rural-urban harmony, decentralization of business activities, development of transport (activity spines for integration of business centers and taking up construction), provision of housing as major economic activity to stimulate employment generation and income distribution.

7. The new Structure Plan (the equivalent of a Master Plan) calls for around 17 primary and secondary Transit-Oriented Development (TOD) areas to be created within Addis Ababa and at least 13 tertiary centers at the sub-city level. According to the plan, these urban centralities will be organized around the concept of TOD, which is development with improved coordination of land use and transport services with the objectives of: i) reducing dependence on private automobiles by concentrating more intensive development near formal, higher-capacity transit services and improving the urban environment to encourage multi-modal and non-motorized access to transit (NMT) environment to access transit; ii) clustering new housing units close to other land uses (such as retail, services, employment and civic spaces) through a more compact and less dispersed land use pattern that reduces the mobility needs of residents and firms and reduces the time devoted to transport; and iii) encouraging the use and sustainability of transit services by clustering more intensive and transit-supportive development near transit services.

8. The key transport and TOD elements of the proposed concept Structure Plan are shown in Figure 1. In addition, it has been suggested that the existing rail line (unused) might also become an important component in the future metropolitan transport network and might provide opportunities for development of 7 TOD areas, five of which are additional to those contemplated in the proposed Structure Plan. This existing rail alignment and the associated potential TOD areas are shown in Figure 2.

\[1\] Non-Motorized Transport here refers to pedestrian and bicycle transport.
Figure 1: Schematic of the Proposed Structure Plan

Source: AASOID 2014

Figure 2: Existing Unused Rail Corridor and Adjacent TOD Areas

Source: Pedro Ortiz 2013
In all, more than 35 TOD areas are contemplated for development in the future. These TOD areas should be developed so as to absorb a critical mass of Addis’ growing population as well as new employment, retail, and services coming to Addis, enabling sustainable and green travel patterns as Ethiopia moves into middle income status. As Addis Ababa faces urban growth rates of 2% per year, at which rate the city’s population will double in 35 years, it is critically important that effective mechanisms to deliver TODs efficiently are rapidly put into place. The current mechanisms for carrying out planning, land supply, and development control, however, are unlikely to efficiently and rapidly deliver TODs. Some of the existing challenges include:

- Multiplicity of institutions involved in the development of urban centers, and the complexity of coordinating the actions of these institutions;
- Lack of clarity about whether and in what circumstances Local Development Plans are likely to be an effective instrument to effect the development of TOD;
- Complexity of coordinating in time and space the land-development process with the mass transport development process; and
- Potential challenges integrating different entities/roles to support common objectives identified in the Structure Plan, particularly across different levels of jurisdiction.

C. Planning and development control in Addis Ababa

10. Note: The purpose of this section is to present to prospective bidders a broad outline of the land development process in Addis Ababa, as understood by the World Bank. It is not intended as a legal description of the process, but rather as the World Bank’s understanding at the present time. The consultant may find specific circumstances are different from that described here. But the purpose of the description is to give a flavor about the likely complexities of developing TOD in this environment.

11. The current structure of the Addis Ababa Land Development and Management Bureau (AALDMB) consists of seven separate agencies as shown in Figure 3. Lack of coordinated action among these agencies in support of the outcomes identified in the Local Development Plans (LDPs) is believed to be a critical reason existing land development outcomes often do not conform to LDPs. The major roles and responsibilities of the different entities are as follows:

- Urban Plan Institute (UPI) is responsible for preparation of urban plans, their revision and modification, and monitoring their implementation.
- Integrated Land Information Center is responsible for organizing, disseminating and updating all data related to land in Addis Ababa.
- Land Development and City Renewal Agency is in charge of preparing developed land, site clearance of slum areas, paying compensation, and developing the infrastructure in collaboration with the service providing bodies.
- Building Permit and Control Authority is in charge of issuing planning consent, building permits, conducting supervisions, and providing certificate of use when the building is finalized as per the per the permit.
• The Land Bank and Transfer Office is responsible for registering all vacant land and leasable land as well as ensuring transfer of land to users as per the new land lease law.
• Immovable Property Registration and Information Agency is responsible for registering and issuing title ownership of land and real property.

In addition to the above, which are directly involved in the land development process, the city administration has also re-established the Integrated Land Information Center (ILIC). ILIC is accountable to the AALDMB and is in charge of the establishment and management of Ground Control Points (GCPs) and GPS active stations, implementation of modern street addressing system and integrated urban land information system.

Figure 3: Organogram of the Addis Ababa Land Administration and Management Bureau

12. In addition to the above, there are two temporary Project Offices that have played a key role in the land development process:

• Title Administration Transitional Period Service Project Office is in charge of land administration such as title deed issuance, collaterals, boundary disputes, etc. It will also ensure the regularization of informal tenure as per article 6.5 of the 2011 lease law, which should be accomplished during 2015 (four years after the coming into force of the lease law of 2011).
• Addis Ababa and Surrounding Oromia Special Zone Master Plan Project Office (AASOID) is in charge of developing a revision to the Structure Plan for the area covering Addis Ababa city and the cities in the surrounding Oromia Special Zone (Suluta, Xafo, Dukem, Gelan, Sebeta, and Burayu).

13. There are two main processes involved in land development and management: land-supply and development control. Land supply and preparation is primarily the purview of the Land Bank and Transfer Office (LBTO) and the Land Development and City Renewal Agency (LDCRA). The LBTO releases land to the LDCRA for preparation, on the basis of the LDP (produced by the Urban Planning Institute), through parcelization, delineation, and construction of necessary
investments in road, electricity, and water supply. The Land Bank and Transfer office then manages the transfer process. In the case of tenders, bidding documents are released by the Land Transfer Unit within the LBTO; at least 3 bids should be submitted for a site to be eligible for transfer. Winning bids are assessed against three criteria: total lease value over lifespan of lease; value of upfront payment at the beginning of the lease; and the number of years to pay on the lease. Once assigned, site development must begin within 18 months of disposition, and be completed within 4 years.

14. Unreliable availability of complete, accurate and up-to-date land information is the foremost bottleneck to Addis Ababa’s land administration and land use management. The existing situation implies the need for implementation of comprehensive and efficient land information management system. Implementation of a land rights and cadastre registration system is an indispensable prerequisite to further improve the real property market, land use planning and development control as well as realization of efficient integrated urban land information management. Establishment of AALRIA and ILIC are key steps toward this requirement. In addition to securing the land use and property rights, these organizations also serve to improve the reliability of land information with the intention that the efficiency of the land administration and effectiveness of the land use management would be enhanced.

15. The key features of the land redevelopment process under AALDMB are shown in the table below is added here to clarify details.
Procedures of Land Development in Expansion Area

- Site selection
- Boundary delineation
- Data collection about the existing situation
- Data collection for compensation (cost estimation)
- Preparation of Compensation payment
- Preparation of land for replacement
- Hand over the replacement land for the relocate
- Requesting for infrastructural provision
- Effect the payment of infrastructural provision
- Effect the compensation payment & allocation of the replacement land

Procedures of Land Development in Inner City
(Urban Renewal)

- Site selection for Renewal
- Delineation of the specific sites
- Preliminary data collection
- Filtering the Ownership right of each parcel
- Data collection for compassion payment for private owners & KIBAD holders
- Preparation of compensation
  - Organize the choice of government house renters’ whether kebele house or condo. house / Land Replacement
  - Send the preference to housing administration
  - Organize the merchant government house renters
  - Prepare land for them
  - Hand over the replacement land for the relocate
  - Plan preparation for infrastructural provision
  - Requiring of payment for infrastructural providers
  - Effect the payment for infrastructural provision
  - Effect the compensation payment for private owners & KIBAD holders
- Supporting the relocates to Relocate and Adopt the new site for them
- Demolish the Existing structures
- Site clearance
- Prepare Implementation plan of each parcels
- Surveying existing topo
- Setting out each Parcels
- Handing over each parcel to land bank
- Project implementation Follow up
16. During the last decade, Addis Ababa has witnessed a massive development performed by the city government and private investors. In order to make the development consistent and sustainable, preparation of high quality urban plan is vital. The Addis Ababa UPI is accountable to prepare the city plan (Structural Plan & Local Development Plans), as well as organize and follow up the city plan implementation. The institute has 4 sub process units (Plan Preparation, Plan Implementation and Follow-up, Research and study, and Regularizations and parcelization desk). Each sub process has professional staff trained in urban planning, architecture, urban engineering, urban management and related socio-economic fields. The institute has prepared several Local Development Plans (LDPs) and urban designs for different parts of the city. The LDPs also prepared in the context of urban upgrading or urban renewal interventions which are selected by the city government and concerned stakeholders. The services provided by the institute are:-

- Preparing or Revising/updating Structural plan (currently delegated to and carried out by AASOID)
- Preparing LDPs and/or Neighborhood Designs
- Plan Implementation follow up
- Urban plan evaluation
- Updating local development plans
- Urban plan study & research
- Base map preparations etc.

The guiding principles of the planning process are shared vision, participatory planning, self-managed planning, mixed development and flexibility in implementation. However, our planning process lacks many things in plan preparation and plan implementation follow-up processes. Many of the LDPs and neighborhood designs have quality problems, and lack integration of land use with transportation networks.

17. Development control is the purview of the Building Permit and Control Authority (BPCA). BPCA is composed of three bodies: the Building Permit Office, which is in charge of building permit provision, the Building Control Office, which is in charge of inspecting the construction in accordance to the permit given, and the Certification of Use Office, which is in charge of providing the certificate of occupancy in accordance the issued building permit when the building is ready and safe for use. Recently, a separate, autonomous Code Enforcement Service was established to enforce code and take corrective action on different aspects of code violations, among them, specific areas, illegal invasion of land and illegal construction. The specific enumerated powers of BPCA include:

---

2When it finds non-compliance, it will issue "work-stop" order and execute the fines and measures stipulated for the committed non-compliance. When the measure to be taken is demolishing, this office will inform the code enforcement service for demolishing.
- issue plan agreement document to developers to whom land has been allocated or legal possessors of land authorizing developers to build in accordance with the structural and local development plans, as well as levels of construction;
- investigate and approve construction designs presented by developers or legal possessors of land to whom plan agreement has been issued (after fulfillment of the requirements provided for the structural and local development plans, as well as construction level and law) on the basis of appropriate law; issue building permits to same; and control that the construction is in accordance with the approved design and issued building permit;
- investigate into and issue license regarding matters of renewal and improvement of construction based on appropriate law;
- ascertain that quality of construction materials supplied to construction sites is up to the quality set by the Construction Industry Development and Control Authority; cause the confirmation by the Construction Industry Development and Control Authority the quality of those it finds deficient in quality;
- keep data regarding constructions within the City Government; update and disseminate same;
- set standards, in consultation with the concerned bodies, for advertisement boards erected within the boundary of the City and posted on buildings within the City;
- issue licenses in accordance with laws and standards, upon assuring that there is legal right to do so, for advertisement boards erected within boundary of the City and posted on buildings in the City; follow up and control that same is erected or posted in accordance with the permit;
- conduct research that enables strengthening coordination of construction; cause the constructors perform their activities in a coordinated manner;
- prepare coordinated and standardized detailed network plan based on the structural plan and standards of the City with the view to harmonize the infrastructure work of the City; transfer same for implementation upon approval;
- cause the infrastructure developers to submit detailed design and construction schedules regarding new construction as well as repairs, renewal and improvement (with the exception of emergency repair works); issue license upon investigation and coordination; follow up and control that the work is done in accordance with the license; take measure if the work is done contrary to the license

These powers are implemented at 5 points in the development control cycle:

- Planning approval – approval to do designs and submit building permit. Building owner needs to demonstrate familiarity with development controls and regulations for the site;
- Design – ensures designs in conformity with development controls and regulations;
- Development Permit – Enables owner to build;
- Inspection – Supposed to be early in construction process, examines positioning of building and structural elements; and
- Occupancy permit – (for category C building) checks for construction to code.
It is to be noted that the BPCA currently has no formal mechanism for relating development impacts to nearby and surrounding traffic back to the building permitting process.

18. This overview of the planning and development control processes in Addis Ababa presented above shows that while there are mechanisms in place to control the land-development process, lack of coordinated action among the agencies of the AALDMB in support of the outcomes identified in the Local Development Plans (LDPs) and Structure Plan is believed to be a critical reason recent land development outcomes often do not conform to LDPs. The implications for the likely success of a TOD program are clear: left to their own devices, these processes and mechanisms on their own are unlikely to yield effective and timely production of TODs to meet urbanization demands. Further work is required to articulate how the city can ensure production and delivery of TODs in a timely manner to match the pace of urban growth and the vision of the Structure Plan.

D. Addis Ababa Urban Transport and Land Use Support Project

19. The City of Addis Ababa is currently preparing an Addis Ababa Transport and Land-use Support project, for financing by the World Bank. While the lead agency for this preparation is the Addis Ababa Road and Transport Bureau (AARTB), AALDMB is one of the intended beneficiary agencies of this project, as some resources will be devoted to providing support for the development of Transit Oriented Development (TOD) as well as other mechanisms to help integrate transport and land-use planning and development in Addis Ababa. At present, it is anticipated that the project will support studies and knowledge exchange for AALDMB to implement urban centers using TOD methods around the emerging mass transport network, consistent with the intentions of the strategic urban master plan, and potentially investments that correspond to the public sector’s portion of effective TOD place-making in a PPP or similar arrangement. In order to prepare for such studies, knowledge exchange and possible investment, there is a need to understand both the nature of the institutional arrangements needed to effectively deliver TOD in the short and medium terms, and the nature of land-markets to understand the possibilities and constraints of a full-fledged TOD program. The present Terms of Reference is intended to accomplish the first of these.

20. The World Bank has obtained resources from the Korean Government, through the Korean Green Growth Partnership, to help facilitate the technical preparation of both the master plan revision and implementation modalities in Addis Ababa to ensure green growth outcomes. The bank intends to use part of these resources to support the work outlined in these Terms of Reference. As the Bank is the executing agency for these resources, the successful consultant will sign a contract with the World Bank for the work outlined here. However, the consultant should organize their work in a manner that addresses AALDMB as the key beneficiary.
II. Objective

21. The primary objective of the current assignment is to help prepare the Addis Ababa City Government (AACG) to realize Transit Oriented Development in accordance with its Structure Plan. This objective will be accomplished by accomplishing four key sub-objectives:

i. identifying suitable TOD approaches given existing land markets, legal frameworks, and institutional structures;
ii. identifying a TOD delivery mechanism (an institutional mechanism/organization that does not require disruption of the existing institutional framework);
iii. recommending realistic and immediately implementable administrative and procedural measures to support that delivery approach; and
iv. recommending two TOD sites for priority pilot implementation.

In accomplishing the above, it is also anticipated that it will be necessary to make recommendations to improve the way Local Development Plans are developed, and make recommendations that streamline and harmonize the delivery process of LDPs and TODs. Use of project-based approaches, such as fully-empowered project teams from different agencies that work as a team in a time-bound arrangement to deliver TODs, should be considered thoroughly. The consultancy will identify both a delivery mechanism (in the form of an organizational structure such as a project team or another structure) for the pilot TOD deliveries and TOD approaches through a consultative process with stakeholders and through independent analysis and assessment using an approach elaborated by the consultant’s proposal and consistent with this Terms of Reference (ToR). TOD approaches are the strategic deployment of plans, administrative and legal tools, and the institutions and agencies of AACG that will enable achievement of TOD land use outcomes, and possible examples include public-private partnerships or parcel-by-parcel redevelopment guided by a small area plan. Consultants are expected to explore, identify and recommend suitable approaches for Addis Ababa taking into account all available information.

22. To clarify, the consultant is not being engaged to propose long-term institutional changes in the planning and development control frameworks, but rather to provide recommendations for immediate and short-term measures to improve TOD delivery within those existing frameworks by identifying obstacles and recommendations for their resolution. However, though long-term structural reform is outside the scope of this work, the consultant is encouraged to provide insights into the way that institutional structures may evolve over the medium- and long-term to ensure more effective and timely delivery of TODs (and other land services) in the future, based on international best practice, and include such discussion in recommendations and dialog with the client.

23. In addition to these specific objectives, the consultancy itself is expected to contribute to capacity development of AALDMB and its relevant departments. This should occur in the following ways:

- While carrying out study and selection of possible TOD sites for pilot implementation, the consultant should involve and cooperate with AALDMB agencies, such as UPI, closely,
exposing them to the various best-practice methodologies that might be utilized for such an assessment.

- During the consultancy contract period, the consultant should evaluate and regularly discuss critical success factors related to TOD development with various agencies comprising AALDMB.
- While provide consultancy service requested under this TOR, the consultant should seek to apply analytical approaches and tools for evidence-based assessments, conforming to best practices in TOD development.

Prospective consultants are encouraged to provide additional suggestions as to how capacity development might be embedded into the work under this consultancy in their proposals.

24. A final note on the objectives of this consultancy. Ethiopian land and property markets are highly idiosyncratic (see Box 1). While the consultant will be expected to have a thorough understanding of those idiosyncrasies (based on existing information and studies), including how they depart from global best practices, in order to make the best recommendations, the consultant is not being engaged to conduct a detailed, quantitative and bottom-up assessment of land markets, nor to develop recommendations for effecting fundamental changes to how land markets work in Addis Ababa. Such recommendations may be necessary in the big picture, but are beyond the scope of the present work. Rather, recommendations should be drawn based on the current realities of how land markets function, plus any reasonably foreseeable changes in the near future.

Box 1. Idiosyncrasies in Ethiopian Land Markets

Land markets in Ethiopia, including in Addis Ababa, are struggling against four structural challenges in the way land is administered. First, leasehold rights – both the ability to obtain them and maintain them – are subordinate to planning documents. That is, legal tenure to land is conditional on the conformity of the land parcels to urban plans and relevant standards for parcelization. This is contrary to international best practice and creates for highly precarious lease-holding security. Second, there are significant gaps governing the relative property rights between urban dwellers and rural dwellers. This establishes a fundamental inequality, and has contributed to unrest and friction in the master plan process in the Greater Addis Ababa and surrounding Oromia metropolitan region. Third, the current system of lease rights in urban areas is very complex and expensive to administer. Land rights and property rights are administered separately, requiring two separate and parallel systems. Furthermore, the system for lease payments is also complex. Interest is charged on the unpaid portion of leases, which is very difficult for leaseholders to understand, and low-paid civil service workers to administer. At the same time, lease auctions are difficult to evaluate, because payments are so complex. Finally, the mechanisms of the formal real estate market are set up in such a way as to require substantial government involvement, slowing down transactions. The government must grant “no objection” to all transactions, and issues lease contracts and certificates to all buyers of buildings in urban areas.
(Adapted from Kaganova, 2015)
III. Scope of Work

25. The consultant shall undertake the following Tasks.

   A. Task 0. Inception Report

26. The Consultant shall prepare an inception report outlining findings from existing data and analytical resources as detailed in the methodology of the proposal, progress towards addressing information gaps and further concrete steps to be taken to fill them, a detailed reporting of the confirmed content and timing of inputs from different partners and stakeholders as outlined in the consultant’s proposal, and the final timeline of each Task of the consultancy. The timeline, data sources, methodologies and other key variables must be consistent with the methodology of the proposal, acceptable to the Bank, and agreed with affected stakeholders.

   B. Task 1: Assessment of TOD Area requirements of the 2014 Master Plan

27. The Consultant shall assess the inputs required to achieve the TOD areas proposed in the Structure Plan taking into account relevant initiatives underway by the Addis Ababa City Government, the Federal Government, other development partners, and the needs of the private sector, as appropriate. This Stocktaking exercise will assess the inputs required to achieve redevelopment itself, particularly the intermediate actions that would need to be taken by the government – whether procedural, administrative, technical analysis, the development or adoption of plans supporting redevelopment, the adoption of modern technological solutions (including use of social media), or otherwise. As this work is considered preliminary to the substantive work of this consultancy, this assessment should be at the framework level rather than at the level of detailed, specific recommendations, and should be informed by the land development process itself. The Assessment should quantify, to the extent possible: the number of potential distinct TOD projects; the estimated total land area involved; the estimated total area of office, retail, and housing space involved; the estimated potential number of housing units created and their quality (linking to cost per square meter based on quality); estimated land and construction costs involved at current prices; rough estimate of property value creation at current prices; and rough estimate of infrastructure investment required at current benchmark costs (not including investments in mass transport network itself). The consultant is expected to utilize appropriate tools to communicate the result of the assessment to non-specialists (e.g. spatial visualization tools). It is anticipated that this assessment may include discussions with stakeholders in the public, private, and financial sectors involved in land development and urban development in the Addis Ababa metropolitan region. It is further anticipated that some, but not all, of this type of assessment may have already been carried out by AASOID in the structure plan preparation process; the purpose of this task is to compile this information and to fill in key missing pieces with the best available information.
C. Task 2: Institutional Assessment

28. The consultant shall undertake a rapid Institutional Assessment (SWOT analysis) with the objective of identifying strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats that would encourage or inhibit actualization of the TOD elements of the Structure Plan. This effort should further elaborate the key inputs necessary for TOD to take place in conformity with the plan as identified in the stocktaking and discussed in the prior workshop. The assessment should include three key sectors: i) the key public sector agencies, ii) the private sector development community, and iii) the public and private financial sectors. The assessment should also evaluate weaknesses and/or obstacles with respect to each sector on at least two levels: structural obstacles, including a lack of incentives, institutional weaknesses or institutional preferences/priorities, and other obstacles that would impede delivery of TOD or result in land development outcomes that do not conform to the TOD elements Structure Plan; and capacity and resource constraints that would lead to bottlenecks in the process. To the extent possible, the Institutional Assessment should address public infrastructure financing mechanisms, construction financing and end-user financing inputs required for successful TOD. The public sector portion of this assessment should be limited to Addis Ababa City government, plus any relevant institutions playing a key role from the Federal Government. Processes for TOD development in cities of the surrounding Oromia special zone will be examined in future work.

D. Task 3. International best practice in TOD delivery

29. The consultant shall examine appropriate models from around the world in terms of how the public sector organizes itself – separately and in partnership with the private sector – to deliver TOD. Emphasis should be placed on models that are applicable to Addis Ababa where public ownership of land and very rapid urban growth are critical issues, as well as on rapidly implemented solutions that do not necessarily involve institutional overhaul. In particular, the consultant should consider multiple approaches to TOD development that have worked elsewhere and may be applicable to Addis Ababa, including project-based approaches.

30. The results from Tasks 1 through 3 should be presented in both a report and a one or two-day workshop with key stakeholders. This workshop should also include participatory discussions of the implications and priorities for the next stage of work.


31. Based on the weaknesses addressed in Task 2, the best-practice lessons learned from Task 3, and feedback from the workshop, the Consultant shall identify i) the critical obstacles to TOD as outlined by Task 2, and ii) recommendations that can be implemented within the next year to overcome those challenges and facilitate delivery of TODs; and iii) further recommendations that can be completed within two to three years. The recommendations should be developed based on a realistic assessment of skills available within the respective sectors (public, private, and financial), coupled with recommendations for skill development and additional resourcing in the
short term, and utilize existing skills and resources appropriately. In developing the recommendations, and as appropriate to ensure buy-in, the consultant may present several viable options for discussion with the client (e.g. in a workshop or other format). The recommendations should include at least the following:

- Proposal for clarification of relationship between LDP and TODs that will influence the structure of the business process reform;
- Proposed structure of core TOD delivery mechanism recommended along with a proposed institutional responsibilities matrix, designating strategic objectives and responsibilities of individual AALDMB agencies in support of delivery of the TOD elements of the Structure Plan, and detailed task descriptions/protocols for different entities to be involved in LDP and TOD development processes;
- Proposed TOD approaches suitable for Addis Ababa; (may include recommendation of an approach to carry out a pilot based to take advantage of existing strengths, if appropriate);
- Job descriptions/ Terms of Reference of staff involved in the recommended entities/delivery mechanism to be involved in LDP and TOD development;
- Description of any legal and/or regulatory changes that might be needed to effect the proposed solution (as well as Terms of Reference for legal consultant to craft language);
- Key next steps and action plan.

F. Task 5. Identification of short-term training, capacity development, and knowledge exchange program to facilitate TOD development in Addis Ababa.

32. The consultant shall identify and provide cost estimates for any training, capacity development, and knowledge exchange (KE) needs that are necessary to implement the proposed solution, and propose options for a responsive training program, including implementation schedule, taking into account any ongoing KE efforts already underway. The consultant should design the elements of the program with concise and measurable objectives, consistent with the World Bank’s Art of Knowledge Exchange methodology.

G. Task 6. Selection of pilot TOD for demonstration of proposed implementation method

33. The consultant shall propose a methodology for prioritizing phasing TOD development within Addis Ababa and for selecting one or two candidate TODs (based on financial and time constraints to be included in the priority methodology) to pilot the proposed delivery mechanism and recommended TOD approach(es). A key criterion would be the extent to which the proposed TOD is connected to the emerging mass transport network in the reasonably foreseeable short-run. The prioritization methodology could be formatted as a multi-criteria decision-making matrix, and should consider strategic / catalytic factors such as: the fiscal impact of redevelopment, the extent and scope of infrastructure needs, project visibility (at national, civic and international levels), strategic political and civic education potential, and land preparation costs, as well as other priorities of the AACG. Upon approval of the proposed prioritization method by both the World Bank and the AACG, the consultant shall apply such a methodology and propose two candidate
TOD sites for further development. This method should be based on international best practice, and should be robust enough to enable further work by the AACG. Pilot TOD areas will be selected from this pool. The selected pilot TOD should not be in the center city/central business district. The results of this assessment should be discussed during a full day workshop with AA city officials.


34. The consultant shall develop the Terms of Reference for a pilot TOD design by a future consultant. These TOR should take into account the proposed TOD delivery mechanism and TOD approach recommendations, and be structured to be implemented by one of the entities proposed in Task 4. These TOR should be included in the final report.


35. As part of the production of the draft final report, the consultant shall develop a three to five page knowledge capture note, documenting the methodology, outcomes, and lessons learned from the consultancy. The purpose of this note shall be to facilitate communication about what was done under the consultancy, and to provide the Bank and the larger TOD development community with practical information about doing TODs in real contexts in the developing world.

IV. Deliverables

36. The following deliverables shall be required:

- Inception report
- Task 1 report
- Task 2 report
- Task 3 report
- Task 1 through 3 workshop, materials & proceedings
- Task 4 report
- Task 5 report
- Task 6 report
- Task 6 workshop, materials & proceedings
- Draft Terms of Reference for pilot TOD design (Task 7)
- Knowledge capture note (Task 8)
- Draft final report (integrating outputs of all 8 tasks)
- Final report

V. Skills required

37. The following skills are required and proposals will be evaluated on the basis of the strength of the teams proposed with respect to the following skills:
a) International Experience in Urban Land Use Planning Team (collective experience): deep understanding of global best practices for public sector entities planning and managing land redevelopment in both market and state-driven economies; knowledge of diverse approaches to urban redevelopment including PPPs, large-scale redevelopment programs, and diverse urban redevelopment approaches; value capture approaches to redevelopment; ability to tailor international experience to the Ethiopian context; in-depth knowledge of the land preparation processes to support TOD in international contexts; and expertise in fiscal impact analysis of redevelopment plans; ability to advise clients regarding TOD phasing/sequencing methodology.

b) Land-use/urban planning: International and local expertise with direct experience in Addis Ababa land markets; direct experience with all aspects of land development processes; working knowledge of the agencies of AALDMB; working knowledge of existing and proposed plans; working knowledge of laws and regulations applicable to redevelopment planning, tenure, land preparation and transfer; working knowledge of the land transfer process.

c) International Urban Design Expertise/Transportation Planning Expertise: International expertise in urban design and Transit-Oriented Development, including best practices for urban design in TOD projects and transportation facility design to accommodate NMT; experience in state-led contexts similar to Addis Ababa; demonstrated knowledge of TOD policy and principles; demonstrated knowledge of best practices in TOD design, as well as demonstrated ability to communicate these practices and ideas graphically.

d) Urban/property development expert: Expertise in property development and real estate development necessary to identify and relate applicable best practices in land preparation processes in international contexts to Addis Ababa; demonstrated experience with urban redevelopment programs; demonstrated knowledge of private sector finance in redevelopment.

e) Urban Land Use Planner: – to help analyze the “idiosyncratic” economics of urban management in Addis and facilitate selection of TOD sites (at least Tasks 2, 3, and 6)

f) GIS specialist: The consultancy team shall include GIS specialists to help analyze the GIS / LAIS-related systems and informational / institutional gaps, provide maps and other visualization tools in support of the consultancy’s communicative inputs (e.g. workshops) and perform other spatial analysis required for implementation of the project. The consultants should outline the scope of GIS components of their proposed work plan as well as competencies of the GIS experts to be included in the proposal.

In addition to the above, the following skills are highly recommended for inclusion in the team:

a) Communications expert/Graphic designer: The consultancy team should include a graphic designer as needed to prepare graphic communication in support of the consultancy’s output.

The consulting firm is expected to identify other staff resources on the consulting team with the necessary skills and experience to carry out the consulting assignment.
VI. Role of World Bank and AALMDB

38. The consultant shall be engaged by the World Bank, and as such, the Bank shall have final say in contract management issues, including acceptance of deliverables and formal communication with respect to any changes to the contract or Terms of Reference. On a day-to-day basis, however, the consultants will be expected to work closely with staff from AALMDB. The Bank will designate a primary counterpart within AALMDB, with whom the consultant shall work, and who will be responsible for technical oversight of the work. AALMDB will provide work space and facilities for the consultant as appropriate.